## Assessment

	Judgement	Research evidence	Additional considerations
Problem	Is the problem a priority? O No O Probably no O Probably yes O Yes O Varies O Don't know	STIs are important because of their magnitude, potential complications and increased risk of HIV. STIs have health, social and economic consequences. The consequences of STIs (such as HSV and syphilis) disproportionately affect women and newborn children. For example, women acquiring primary HSV in the third trimester of pregnancy may result in congenital herpes, leading to neurocognitive problems, developmental delays or death of infants. Congenital syphilis can also cause serious morbidity or death among infants. Presentation of genital ulcer disease is a major challenge for clinicians to distinguish STI-related versus non-STI-related causes. Many individuals keep having sex even in the presence of a genital ulcer. It has been proposed that timely diagnosis of STIs could	
		reduce HIV incidence.	
		Molecular based tests enable etiological diagnosis to guide appropriate treatment (such as multiplex PCR test for HSV and syphilis) but are expensive and not available in many settings.	
est accuracy	How accurate is the test? O Very inaccurate Inaccurate O Accurate O Very accurate O Varies O Don't know	<ul> <li>We conducted a systematic review (2–4), searching up to</li> <li>September 2019, of the sensitivity and specificity of a syndromic management approach to identify multiple STIs related to anogenital ulcers. In summary, we identified four articles that assessed the diagnostic accuracy of the clinical diagnosis of a pathogen causing genital ulcer disease to detect any STI (Table A6.1), 15 studies for herpes (Table A6.2), 15 studies for syphilis (Table A6.3) and 13 studies for chancroid (Table A6.4). We found no studies on detecting lymphogranuloma venereum.</li> <li>For detecting herpes from a clinical diagnosis of herpes, 15 studies provided 20 estimates for pooling. The pooled sensitivity for detecting herpes using a syndromic management approach is 40.4% (95% CI: 23.0–60.6%), and pooled specificity is 88.0% (95% CI: 75.3–94.6%).</li> <li>For detection of syphilis using clinical diagnosis of syphilis among individuals with genital ulcer disease, 15 studies provided 22 estimates for pooling. The pooled sensitivity for detecting syphilis is 64.4% (95% CI: 44.8–80.2%) and pooled specificity as 3.7% (95% CI: 44.8–80.2%) and pooled specificity</li> </ul>	
		The global distribution, incidence and prevalence of causal agents of genital ulcer disease varies widely by geographical region and population subgroup. This is important, since the positive and negative predictive values depend on the prevalence of pathogens. <b>Other considerations related to the accuracy of tests</b> We found that the accuracy of the syndromic approach depends	
		on clinician skill and experience, clinical setting (STI centre versus primary care) and patient characteristics (membership of subpopulation(s)). The positive and negative predictive values may be worse among	
		non-STI clinic attendees (because of lower prevalence of STIs among "general populations") (24).	
		people living with HIV and those without HIV (12).	

	Judgement		Research evidence						
effects	How substantial are the desirable anticipated effects of syndromic approach?Desirable effects and undesirable effectsO TrivialThe potential consequences of true positive could include appropriate treatment, cure, side-effects, partner notification, reduced transmission of STIs and HIV, resistance, couple difficulties and costs. The potential consequences of true negative could include alternative diagnoses possible and psychological benefit.O TrivialThe potential consequences of false negative could include cure still possible, persistent symptoms, complications, STI and/or HIV transmission, no counselling and no partner notification.O LargeThe potential consequences of false positive could include inappropriate treatment, side-effects, antimicrobial resistance, couple difficulties and costs.O Don't knowGRADE summary of findings table for clinical diagnosis of STIs, we calculated the number of people appropriately treated (true positive), the number of missed cases (false negative) and the number of people treated unnecessarily or overtreated (false positive).					The Guideline Development Group agreed that the desirable effects of syndromic management (few unnecessarily treated) were small compared with treating all. The Guideline Development Group also agreed that the undesirable effects (number of miscad cases)			
esirable	Treatment of peo	were moderate compared with							
D	Pooled sensitivity: 0. Test result	40 (95% CI: 0.23 to 0.6 Number of re patients tes Prevalence 30%	1) esults per ted (95% Prevaler	Pooled sp 100 CI) nce 70%	Number of participants (studies)	Certainty of the Evidence	particular for syphilis (due to the consequences of transmission).		
	True positives	Typically seen in <b>12</b> (7 to 18)	Typically	( seen in	(studies)		Overtreatment may be		
	False negatives	18 (12 to 23)	<b>42</b> (28 to 54)		(15)	High <sup>a</sup>	acceptable if high morbidity		
	True negatives	62 (53 to 66)	26 (23 to 28)		2667	$\oplus \oplus \oplus \oplus$	and mortality		
	False positives	8 (4 to 17)	8 (4 to 17) 4 (2 to 7)			Highª	cases requires		
	CI: Confidence inter Explanations <sup>a</sup> Some heterogeneit	controlling the STI in the population (such as syphilis).							
	GRADE summary Treatment of peo	However, there is still a risk of unnecessary treatment and							
	Pooled sensitivity: 0.	potential for STI-related							
	Test result	Number of re patients tes Prevalence 5% Typically seen in	esults per ted (95% Prevaler Typically	100 CI) nce 10% / seen in	Number of participants (studies)	Certainty of the Evidence (GRADE)	stigma due to low specificity of syndromic management.		
	True positives	3 (2 to 4)	6 (4	to 8)	2667	$\oplus \oplus \oplus \bigcirc$	Underdiagnosis		
	False negatives	<b>2</b> (1 to 3)	4 (2	to 6)	(15)	Moderate <sup>a</sup>	of herpes may not be a problem		
	True negatives	80 (64 to 88)	75 (60	to 84)	2667	$\oplus \oplus \oplus \bigcirc$	(except for pregnant women)		
	raise positives CI: Confidence inter Explanations <sup>a</sup> Estimates from stud	since adequate treatment with antiviral agents may not be easily accessible or too expensive in resource-limited settings.							



	Judgement	Research evidence	Additional considerations
Certainty of effects	What is the overall certainty of the evidence of effects of the test? O Very low O Low Moderate O High O No included studies		
Values	Is there important uncertainty about or variability in how much people value the main outcomes? O Important uncertainty or variability O Possibly important uncertainty or variability Probably no important uncertainty or variability O No important uncertainty or variability	The Guideline Development Group placed greater value on not missing cases than on unnecessary treatment.	
Balance of effects	Does the balance between desirable and undesirable effects favour the intervention or the comparison? • Favours the comparison • Probably favours the comparison • Does not favour either the intervention or the comparison • Probably favours the intervention • Probably favours the intervention • Favours the intervention • Varies • Don't know	Treating all was favoured since there were no missed cases in people presenting with ulcers, and there was little value placed on unnecessarily treating people.	

THAT HANN AND H

AND

THO

	Judgement	Research evidence					со	Additional Insiderations	
Resources required	How large are the resource requirements (costs)? O Large costs O Moderate costs Negligible costs and savings O Moderate savings O Large savings O Large savings O Varies O Don't know	Need for better training for nurses working in primary health care settings in Botswana (28).         Etiological diagnosis requires training, infrastructure, time and money.							
dence of required resources	What is the certainty of the evidence of resource requirements (cotts)2	Korenromp (29 STI or syndrome	?9) reported the unit Treatment dose per day		Drugs, per dose	tment. Treatment duration (days)	Drugs p treatme	er ent	Drugs + service delivery
	<ul> <li>Very low</li> <li>Low</li> <li>Moderate</li> <li>High</li> <li>No included studies</li> </ul>	Herpes Syphilis	Acyclovir 400 mg Benzathine PCN		3 1	7	US\$ 0.04 US\$ 0.44	1 1	US\$ 11.05 US\$ 11.65
		Chancroid	2.4 M Azithromycin 500 mg		2	1	US\$ 0.38	3	US\$ 10.95
/ of evi		STI Tort Cort Somico Total							
							delivery		
ů		Syphilis, herpes, chancroid Syphilis		mP0 Rap	LR id test	?? US\$ 0.50	?? US\$ 3.00		US\$ 3.50
Cost-effectiveness	Does the cost- effectiveness of the intervention favour the intervention or the comparison? • Favours the comparison • Probably favours the comparison • Does not favour either the intervention or the comparison • Probably favours the intervention • Probably favours the intervention • Favours the intervention • Varies • No included studies	SyphilisRapid testUS\$ 0.50US\$ 3.00US\$ 3.50Overall, the Guideline Development Group agreed that, although there are few differences between the costs of treating all, not treating and syndromic management, the costs of more cases missed with syndromic management made treating all the more cost-effective.Adams et al. (30) examined the cost-effectiveness of syndromic management (including genital ulcer disease) in pharmacies in Lima, Peru. They reported an overall cost saving of US\$ 1.51 per adequately managed case, from a societal perspective.The mean cost per syphilis treated for syndromic management of genital ulcer disease cases in China was US\$ 13.54 in 2003 (6).Cost-effectiveness analysis in Cambodia: cost per genital ulcer disease case = US\$ 43.21 (USD, 2002) for men from the general population, US\$ 43.56 for women from the general population and US\$ 44.05 for female sex workers.US\$ 10.15 per syndrome treated in the United Republic of Tanzania (in 1993) – no disaggregated data for genital ulcer disease (31). The average cost per STI treated in a primary care setting in the Central African Republic (including 7% with genital ulcer disease) was US\$ 21.58 for an etiological approach (33). The authors conclude that, in Taiwan, China, syndromic management was more cost-effective than etiological diagnosis in terms of cost per person with STI treated (health-care							

	Judgement	Research evidence	Additional considerations
Cost-effectiveness		A modelling study to evaluate the incremental cost–effectiveness ratio of the WHO 2003 genital ulcer disease algorithm versus the 1994 genital ulcer disease algorithm reports that the incremental cost–effectiveness ratio for treating HSV-2 ranged from US\$ 0.50 to US\$ 8.50 depending on the prevalence of genital ulcer disease causes ( <i>Haemophilus ducreyi</i> , true positive, HSV-2) ( <i>34</i> ). Syndromic management is likely to be cost-saving in rural South Africa, considering its potential impact on reducing HIV incidence ( <i>35</i> ). In Côte d'Ivoire, the mean drug cost per cure = US\$ 4.50 (in 1994) and mean direct cost per cure = US\$ 4.90 ( <i>36</i> ).	
Equity	What would be the impact on health equity? O Reduced O Probably reduced Probably no impact O Probably increased O Increased O Varies O Don't know	The cost of antiviral agents might be prohibitive for some people or in some settings. The cost of STI management – including consultation, drugs and tests – might also be prohibitively high for some subpopulations. Partner notification processes in resource-limited settings are poorly described and largely non-existent.	Diagnostic test for ulcers (such as M-PCR) are costly, technically sophisticated, time-consuming and thus rarely affordable, available or accessible in resource-limited settings. If a diagnostic is used, the patient might need to return to discuss the results.
Acceptability	Is the intervention acceptable to key stakeholders? O No O Probably no Probably yes O Yes O Varies O Don't know	<ul> <li>Clinicians</li> <li>Pharmacy and clinicians offered syndromic management in Peru – community randomized controlled trial (<i>37</i>).</li> <li>More than 90% of 100 clinicians from Pakistan were willing to attend educational sessions and follow the national STI treatment protocols (<i>38</i>).</li> <li>Concerns about how general practitioners treat people with genital ulcer disease in Namibia (<i>39</i>).</li> <li>Difficulties in providing syndromic STI management noted among health-care providers (doctors and midwives) in Karachi (<i>40</i>).</li> <li>Patients</li> <li>83% of patients in the United Republic of Tanzania reported satisfaction with STI services using syndromic management (<i>41</i>).</li> <li>For algorithms that required follow-up (such as that in Rwanda) (<i>42</i>), 50% failed to return for follow-up.</li> </ul>	May be difficulties from health-care providers in communicating or discussing sensitive issues related to sex. Symptomatic patients may not disclose their symptoms for a variety of reasons (fear of stigma, lack of access, etc) Immediate relief of symptoms may be preferred rather than waiting for test results

THE HEALTH

THEFT

ANDY

	Judgement	Research evidence	Additional considerations
Feasibility	Is the intervention feasible to implement? O No Probably no O Probably yes O Varies O Don't know	Etiological diagnosis requires skilled personnel and sophisticated equipment and is expensive and time-consuming. <b>Successful use of syndromic management</b> Syndromic management for genital ulcer disease has been implemented in many resource-limited settings with variable success: Ethiopia (43,44), Kenya (24,45), Malawi (46,47), Peru (23), United Republic of Tanzania (48), Peru (49), India (50–53), United Republic of Tanzania (41), Zambia (22), Namibia (39), China (6), Malawi (54), Zimbabwe (55), Karachi (40), South Africa (25,56–59), Bangladesh (53), Burkina Faso (54), Brazil (60), Central African Republic (32), Rwanda (42), Côte d'Ivoire (36), Swaziland (61), Gambia (62) and Mozambirue (63)	Considerations Syndromic management often provided at primary care level (including pharmacies) in low- and middle- income countries without clinical examination. A syndromic algorithm may
		Standardized simulated patients visited pharmacies in the United Republic of Tanzania but found challenges for pharmacies to adequately manage genital ulcer disease syndromes (48). Pharmacy staff in Gambia were willing to offer syndromic management, but none of the simulated patients with genital ulcer disease would be treated appropriately (64). Rural clinics in South Africa – only 9% were correctly managed using a syndromic management approach (no disaggregated data for ganital ulcer disease) (66).	be preferable to nothing, enabling health-care providers to make a diagnosis rapidly without special skills or sophisticated laboratory
		A survey of 43 doctors working in South Africa found that 23% had correct knowledge about managing genital ulcer disease ( <i>66</i> ). Only 9% of patients in South Africa received comprehensive syndromic management ( <i>67</i> ). None of the 50 general practitioners interviewed in Namibia could manage genital ulcer disease properly according to the syndromic	If syndromic management is to be scaled up, it is essential that adequate training and supervision is provided
		management guidelines ( <i>39</i> ). Interviews with health-care workers from 240 health-care facilities in six countries in western Africa found suboptimal STI management, with effective treatment given to only 14% of the patients ( <i>68</i> ). Community pharmacies see many potential STIs, but none of the 85 head pharmacists from South Africa correctly identified the treatment for genital ulcers ( <i>69</i> ). Nurses in Rwanda could deliver STI syndromic management in	Ongoing need for regular updating of syndromic management protocols in accordance with changing trends of STIs.
		<ul> <li>Syndromic management protocol followed for 70% of genital ulcer disease cases presenting to Male Health Clinic in India (52).</li> <li>Interviews with 120 GPs and 244 occupational health nurses working in the private sector in South Africa in 1997 (59): 14% of GPs reported effective treatment for genital ulcer disease.</li> <li>Training</li> <li>A mixed-methods study of 250 clinicians in Ethiopia, including the use of mystery patients, found that only 13% were trained in the syndromic management of STIs (70), highlighting the need for training and supervision.</li> <li>Sixteen nurses from primary health centres in Nigeria were trained to manage STIs using a syndromic approach, demonstrating its acceptability and feasibility (62).</li> <li>Doctors and paramedics in India were successfully trained for syndromic case management (71).</li> <li>Surveillance of STIs</li> <li>Change in the causes of genital ulcer disease over time in Malawi (2000 (620))</li> </ul>	Need ongoing evaluation of the quality of the services offering syndromic management, such as adherence to the algorithms. Intermittent etiological diagnosis to track changes in the underlying epidemiology of STIs causing the syndromes and thus whether the antibiotics prescribed need

A A A A A A A A

TH